

# ICOMOS ISC20C AGM TRENTO – MINUTES

2nd September 2018

Sala Belli, Provincia Autonoma di Trento, Piazza Dante 15, Trento, ITALY

## 1. Welcome and apologies (SB)

**APOLOGIES AND ANNUAL REPORTS RECEIVED FROM 39 Members** Enrique Madia (Argentina), Wallace Loo(HK/UK), Marisa Navarro (Spain), Jorg Haspel (Germany) Thomas Will (Austria) Eman Alissi, Ho Weng Hin (Singapore) Nilufer Yoney (Turkey), Ofelia Sanou(CR). Luiz Fernando Rhoden (Brazil), Svitlana Smokneska (Russia) Ebru Omay (Russia), Enrique Madia (Argentina), Pamela Jerome (Greece), Emilia Kaleva ( Russia) , Lubjinka Stolinova (Russia), Phillip Hartley (NZ), Pablo Gomez Porter (Mexico) , Miguel Iwandare (Mexico) Giacinta Jean (Italy). Emmeline Henderson (Ireland) David Jones (Australia), Carmen Daly, Helen Lardener (Australia), Catherine Ettinger (Mexico), Sonia Ifko (Slovenia) Louise Cox (Australia), Natalia Dushkina (Russia), AGK Menon (India), Kai Weise (Nepal), Josephina Guitierrez (Mexico), Sangeeta Bagga (India), Catherine Ettinger (Mexico), Laura Ingerpru (Estonia), Christiana Guardono Freeman (Australia), Stuart Tappin (UK), Gunny Harboe, (USA), Annabel Lopez (India); Sonia Ifko (Slovenia) Tanya Adamic (Slovenia)

**ANNUAL REPORTS RECEIVED FROM 10 Members present:** Kyle Normandin (USA); Sheridan Burke (Australia), Christian Schmuckle Mollard (France), Leo Schmidt (Germany), Smriti Pant (India), Britt Wisth (Sweden), Susan Macdonald (USA), Jonas Malmberg (Finland), Kiran Joshi (India); Stefania Landi (ICOMOS Italy),

**APOLOGIES:** Robert Moore (Australia), Amabale Garcia (Spain), Stephanie van de Vorde (Belgium), Carlos Messen (Costa Rica), Agnes Callait (France) Enrique De Andas (Mexico) Enrique Madia (Argentina)

## 2. PRESENT

**46 participants introduced themselves:**

1. Sheridan Burke (ICOMOS Australia) Secretary General, acting as Chairman
2. Kyle Normandin (ICOMOS USA) Vice President
3. Olaf Steen (ICOMOS Norway) Vice President
4. Smriti Pant (ICOMOS India and UK)
5. Leo Schmidt (ICOMOS Germany) Vice President
6. Britt Wisth (ICOMOS Sweden)
7. Riitta Salastie (ICOMOS Finland)
8. Susan Macdonald (ICOMOS Australia & USA)
9. Ola Wedebrunn (ICOMOS Copenhagen?)
10. Grethe Pontoppidan (ICOMOS Denmark)
11. Goncalo Morginho (Portugal, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
12. Senais Joseph Nyambo (Tanzania, BTU student, non-ICOMOS observer)
13. Zeido Zeido (Syria, BTU student, non-ICOMOS observer)
14. Noura Alsaleh (Syria, BTU student, non-ICOMOS observer)
15. Siyu Zhou (China, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
16. Kiran Joshi (ICOMOS India)

17. Giulia Boller (ETH Zurich PhD student, non-ICOMOS observer)
18. Stefania Landi (ICOMOS Italy)
19. Concetta Lenza (ICOMOS Italy Board Member)
20. Horacio Fernandez (ICOMOS Spain)
21. Fernando Espinosa de los Monteros (ICOMOS Spain)
22. Virginia Rush (ICOMOS Argentina, EPWG)
23. Jean-Marc Basyn (ICOMOS Belgium)
24. Sabine Kuban (Germany, BTU student, non-ICOMOS observer)
25. Eman Assi
26. Martin Horacek (ICOMOS Czech Republic)
27. Jonas Malmberg (ICOMOS Finland)
28. Jack Pyburn (ICOMOS USA)
29. Yoshiyuki Yamana (ICOMOS Japan)
30. Saikaku Toyokawa (ICOMOS Japan)
31. Tamotsu Itu (ICOMOS Japan)
32. Shradhha Bhatawadekar (India, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
33. Paola Scaramuzza (Italy/France, ICOMOS France?)
34. Christiane Schmuckle Mollard (ICOMOS France)
35. Enrique Xavier de Anda Alanis (ICOMOS Mexico)
36. Fabio Campolongo (Italy, non-ICOMOS observer?)
37. (Nicole Franceschini (ICOMOS Italy))
38. (Alexandra Skedzuhn-Safir (ICOMOS Germany))
39. (Katelyn Williams (BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer))

Later:

40. Valentina Araya (Chile, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
41. Golniz Esmailpour Bazzaz (BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer??)
42. Aashlesha Maslekar (India, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
43. Waltraud Kofler Engl
44. Mohammed Abu Al Hasan (Bangladesh, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
45. Katherine Majlund Jensen (Denmark, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)
46. Kelsey Mass (USA, BTU Student, non-ICOMOS observer)]

### **3. Welcome to Trento from Fabiano Campolongo (translated by Nicole Franchesini)**

Followed by presentation of copies of “The Conservation Plan” and Madrid-New Delhi Document to Fabiano (SB)

### **4. Appointment of Rapporteur and Approval of Agenda**

SB moved appointment of SP as rapporteur. Seconded by KN  
Agenda approved

### **5. Approval Meeting Minutes, December 10, 2017 New Delhi**

Minutes pre-circulated with this year’s reports

SB thanks KJ and KN for organisation of forum for ISC20C members in Delhi at our last AGM. Delhi Meeting Minutes approved SB seconded by SM

### **6. Report from the President (GH)**

SB reads apology from GH

No report received

## **7. Report from the Secretary General (SB) - See pre-circulated report**

**7.1 Thank you for Trento meeting organisation:** A very sincere thanks to Leo Schmidt and Nicole Franchesini who have done so much to make the meeting possible. Thanks to the Municipality of Trento and especially Fabiano Campolongo and colleagues for your generous hospitality to ISC20C in hosting this meeting.

**7.2 Transition of Bureau:** Following the election in 2017, the new bureau is meeting monthly by teleconference and transitioning projects and roles.

**7.3 Mentoring:** Young professionals mentoring programme launched successfully as pilot scheme with Cottbus University, thanks LS SP for a great deal of work and patience getting program started. At conclusion of program in January an evaluation with all participants will enable us to determine future steps.

**7.4 Communications:** Facebook, Instagram continue thanks to KN, a major website update underway. Planning on creating an ISC20C newsletter in 2019 (LM) –

***ACTION: volunteers invited! For ISC20C social media activity***

**7.5 Membership:** SB thanks members for annual reports received to date, reminds all members need to provide an annual report to remain defined as an **active member**. Active members also encourage new members, contribute to the ISC20C toolkit and participate in ISC20C projects. Due to new EU Data Privacy measures, we will also transition silent members to a mailing list. Thanks RS and Clare Moore for transitioning ISC20C to an excel database – ISC20C membership is steadily growing.

SB warmly invited members to become more involved in the many projects of the Committee. Listed in the Action Plan. Noted that committee activity and engagements are a critical factor in transitioning between associate and expert, - years of work experience are not the sole requirements. This is part of a larger discussion about what constitutes an expert member we will need to have when ICLAFI provides new ISC by-laws later this year.

***ACTION: Aiming to finalise review of membership records with RS in 2019***

**RS reports on membership** ISC20C has 50 Designated Voting Members; 70 expert members (including 17 foundation members) and 54 Associate members 5 pending members. 179 members in total. We welcome today three new voting members – from Chile, Italy and Colombia.

**7.6 External Partnerships:** Co-operation with partners Getty Conservation institute, TICCIH, DOCOMOMO e.g. thematic framework continue successfully; UIA currently a silent partner.

### **7.7 Internal ICOMOS Partnerships:**

- ISC20C Annual report provided to ICOMOS International by Secretary General;
- EPWG activities – SB is part of trio guiding the process at the international level, SP is the ISC20C EP representative on the EPWG. Monthly teleconferences, very active group, communicating in multiple languages!

**7.8 Future Meetings: October 2019 Adcom** meeting is to be held in Marrakesh Morocco, 14-18 October, Perhaps ISC20C AGM could pair with this?

***ACTION: KN is contacting Morocco National Committee. Other offers to host AGM welcome.***

**October 2020 -Sydney**, ISC20C will meet at Sydney Opera House in conjunction with ICOMOS General Assembly 3-10 October. SB very pleased to welcome ISC20C members to Australia. Looking at potential historic concrete conference in week prior and tours to modern heritage sites in Sydney. GA 2020 website opens soon.

**ACTION: SB/LM developing Historic Concrete conference, Seidler tour and cocktails event.**

**7.9 Scientific Council Officer Candidacy:** SB has been nominated by Bureau to stand for election as SCO at the Adcom meeting in December in Argentina. Motion seconded by KN  
Comments or objections from AGM participants? None! Resolution passed by warm acclamation

7.10 Brief update on **mASEANa** from YY who will continue as our representative. (Next mASEANa meeting - 25<sup>th</sup>-28<sup>th</sup> October 2018 – Bangkok, invitation to join)

**7.11 Action Priorities for next year for SG: Transitioning presidential roles to GH; finalise membership database with RS, initiate newsletter with LM and upgrade website so it's always current with KN, fine tune the triennial action plan with bureau, re-engage with mASEANa– involvement initiated a few years ago, and ISC20C would like to get more actively involved with the project once again. Re-start the MAP review project.**

SB asks if anyone has questions and comments? SG report accepted – SB, seconded by KN

**8. Report from the Treasurer (EA)-** see pre-circulated report

Current bank balance is 2083 Euros, maintained in Paris Secretariat accounts for ISC20C.

Innova project budget currently being reviewed by Secretariat. Current received grant funding from Innova concrete is c. €101,122.16 as of January 1, 2018 (total is C E250,000). KN and GH managing Innova finances separately- see KN report and Attachment

SB asks if anyone has questions and comments on Treasurer report? Accepted – EA / KN

**ACTION: Priorities for next year for Treasurer: monitoring Innova funds; incoming WMW fees; investigating institutional membership development**

**9. Report on 20C thematic heritage framework studies (SM)-**See pre-circulated report  
ISC20C initiated 2009, GCI engaged in 2011. GCI managed project engaged consultant historians and managed an international PRG. GCI will publish the report by the middle of the 2019, more info in GCI post cards disseminated

The DOCOMOMO conference in Ljubljana has confirmed the belief that the framework is going to be very useful and is headed in the right direction. Note, SB will present a petcha kucha later to provide an overview of current status of the project

**10. Report by Vice Presidents**

**10.1 Leo Schmidt-**See pre-circulated report

**10.1.1 Mentoring programme** 14 pairs working well!

Learnings so far – Sabine + Stuart – first contact has been established / FEM + Aashlesha – a woman mentee, hoping to meet in this meeting, thanks to Leo for this initiative, good to discuss the way in which the M-M relationship is envisaged / G + EM – will have first skype after the AGM / Siyu + SB – first couple of meetings over Skype, looking forward to

interaction in Trento / EA + Denise – great programme, although EA does not work in the area of intangible heritage aspects!!(swap arranged) / SP + SM – good organisation of meetings, agenda etc... / Britt and Hassan – have had the first contact, he is going to stay with her in Stockholm in September, and visit WH cemetery from 1920s, airport from 1930s, urban settlement from 1950s etc. projects are being talked about.

**Action: Evaluation report in January**

### **10.1.2 Madrid-New Delhi Document Translation**

Study project at BTU Cottbus. Translations expected in 16 languages, co-ordination with expert and voting members of relevant national committees. A few have already submitted. The project is also an extension of the mentoring programme. Thanks to Katelyn Williams for the study project teaching (LS)

SB Other translations also being worked by a French translation group (CSM)  
Thanks to the team translating in Spanish (EM, AG and CV) and Italian (SL and NF)

SB/SM Described the evolution of MNDD from the MD as a process. This document translations may bring further evolution of the contents and concepts of the document

#### **Discussion**

Q Any contested terminology in translations? (SM) What methodology has been adopted to cope with a standard translation of the glossary into multiple languages?

A (LS) Aware of the challenges.

(CSM) Glossary is important, as is the meaning in the context of the sentences

(YY) Each NatCom should set up a national group for translations. Japan has one

EM has organised a Spanish Translation group that is working well.

(SB) Glossary has been translated by an expert member from the NatCom and the student working on it from the country

(Stefania L) Translations of “heritage, significance”, etc particularly challenging in Italian (Input may be available from ICCROM and WH Category II centre in Bahrain could be two institutes to approach for support in this regard?)

(GM) Urgent need for countries using the same language to identify common grounds

(Sweden) 5 different Nordic versions will take a long time to translate

(OS) Proposes to form a regional Nordic group to work on the translations

(Virginia R) Interested in contributing, notes the EPWG translations group

(RS) Working on first Finnish translation on her own proved challenging. Invited other experts to join the translations group to debate definitions.

***ACTION Bureau to advance translation options (LS)***

***10.2 Olaf Steen*** - See pre-circulated report

#### **Advocacy and Heritage Alerts:**

##### **This year heritage alerts included:**

- Red Flag Factory, St Petersburg, Russia
- International Congress Centre (ICC), Berlin, Germany
- Government Offices Y Block, Oslo Norway
- Lake Burley Griffin foreshores, Canberra, Australia ICOMOS (support)
- Maison du Peuple Clichy, France
- Palace of fine Arts San Sebastian;

- Denmark Roskilde Vikingshalle

Time consuming process- Olaf is developing, new heritage alert forms and procedures are needed key is to identify the site significance, threats and solutions rather than lots of description and history. Invites discussion on ways of simplification of the process. Invites more members to be involved with HA sub-committee  
Suggests a letter of warning as the first stage and then a complete HA, accompanied by good documentation. This could be a solution, as used for Norway and Spain in past.

SB noted that an alert must be supported/known to the respective NatCom and Paris Secretariat advised in advance. Gave further background to the development of ISC20Cs HA work and templates, which ones succeeded. Site must be of more than local significance, usually its regionally important, but not necessarily of world heritage.

#### **Discussion:**

(Sweden) What is the understanding of OUV? Of significance – different in each country?

(CSM) Reference to the Moscow agreement with DOCOMOMO, and recommends working with DOCOMOMO experts

(SB) Most of the initial information the Committee receives in the first instance just a very brief letter requesting help with not enough information to generate a defensible HA

(EA) Suggests entire Bureau sign HA letters, subject to agreement of the ISC20C Pres.

(KN) Summarises – basic amount of information is necessary and more helping hands are required as part of the HA Sub-committee to assess significance and options etc.

(OS) we need a simpler process including a template that requires proponent to identify the site significance, threats and solutions

(CSM) Sometimes there is no solution. We facilitate discussion!

(SB) Must identify which approach to be adopted so politicians and other stakeholders involved are supported in taking the next steps of decision making for the site

(SB) Nat Coms are able to do HAs on their own as well- see ICOMOS website

***ACTION: OS/GH working on revised template and process. Will be in touch with HA Volunteers offering – Enrique A, Kiran Joshi, Fernando Espinosa de los Monteros, Horatio del Castillo, Eman Assi, Aashlesha M, Giulia Boller, Waltraud Käufer Engl; Fabio Campolongo Goncalo Morginho Interest from other mentees of the Mentoring Program?  
OS to contact and organise the new team***

***10.3 Enrique Madia / Smriti Pant-*** See pre-circulated report on ISC20C Toolkit  
Great to see the on-line toolkit being taken up in many languages. EM thanks SP.

***ACTION: Ongoing contributions of items to toolkit welcome***

***10.4 Kyle Normandin-*** See pre-circulated report

**10.4.1 Desktop reviews for WMF.** Reviews undertaken by ISC20C members in 2015 and 2017  
Expert members worked with associate members, and the involvement of the Committee with the reviews for the WMF was hugely successful. Expecting the same opportunity to come up in 2019 – around May. A quick turnaround is expected – roughly 4 weeks between getting the documents for review and submitting the review itself.

(SM) Suggest the call for Watch nominations is shared with ISC20C members so they can submit applications for the upcoming round if they are aware of such a site.

Q(Jean Marc) Are there any members of WMF that are also members of ISC20C?

A(SM/KN/SB) No. WMF is not a membership-based organisation.

***ACTION Members be ready to help with WMW reviews April/May***

**10.4.2 Socialist Heritage Initiative** Active research group, anyone interested in being part of the Working Group should be in touch with Joerg Haspel, Dumitru Rusu and Anke Zalivako

**10.4.3 Website and Social Media update** Website being restructured since last year with DR's help to LM (Facebook) and DR (Instagram) have been active with social media updates LM is now stepping down from running social media with KN to do just the newsletter More active volunteers are needed – especially younger generation students

***ACTION KN contact 4 volunteers – Valentina Arya, Hassan, Senais Nyambo, Kelsie Moss***

**10.4.4 Innova Concrete Project-** See pre-circulated report

Working Group is now expanded to 20 people

A WG meeting has been organised in Bolzano on 3<sup>rd</sup> September afternoon, and will be open to observers as well, welcome to join.

**The research project has several deliverables**

1. 5 workshops, first of which will be held 23-24 October – in Madrid and Gijon, Spain. Then four more meetings – dates TBD, will be in February, Rome, Italy; later 2019 Warsaw, Poland; Abruzzo, Italy; and Cadiz, Spain (FEM)
2. Stefania Landi – brief overview on the current status of “20 of 100 best concrete buildings, sites and places in Europe” element. Current survey underway.
3. Benchmark document on repair of Historic Concrete is in development (KN and SL)

**Discussion:** Innova concrete working group is currently defining roles on the project. SM asks how to achieve equity and greater transparency regarding working group activity, attendance at upcoming meetings and available travel stipends for interested members? KN advised current process of responsibilities for grant acquittal and Innova organising committee presence. Desire to broaden member engagement.

**Next steps:** KN /GH and other Working Group members will attend Workshop no. 1 in Madrid and Gijon, Spain. Innova concrete budget has been submitted for review by ICOMOS Paris Secretariat.

***ACTION KN: UPLOAD Innova concrete summary description and information to ISC20C website; provide budget for attachment to AGM minutes.***

## **11. ISC20C Triennial Action Plan**

**KN led meeting through existing action plan, seeking volunteers for projects**

1. **Approaches to the Conservation of Twentieth Century Heritage (Madrid-New Delhi Document)** provides international benchmark guidance about how to practically conserve and manage C20 heritage places. Publication December 2017 ongoing translation and international promotion. **Project Leader: Kyle Normandin with Leo Schmidt**
2. **Twentieth Century Concrete Research** (Innova Concrete Research Grant 2020). A three-year partnership with University of Cadiz and European Partners, including workshops and publications. **Project Leader: Gunny Harboe with Kyle Normandin**
3. **Emerging Professionals Mentoring** Pilot Project of 14 mentees from Cottbus University, Germany with expert ISC20C members, based on Australia ICOMOS process. **Project Leaders: Leo Schmidt and Sheridan Burke with Smriti Pant**
4. **Twentieth Century Thematic History Framework:** Working with the Getty Conservation Institute in Los Angeles, to develop a Historic Thematic Framework to help researchers to identify potentially significant places and sites by defining the historic themes that

characterized the Twentieth Century + indicative examples. **Publictation anticipated 2019.**  
**Project Leader: Susan Macdonald with Enrique de Anda Alanis**

5. **Twentieth Century Heritage Toolkit** is a web-based toolkit of reference resources for conserving the heritage sites and places of the Twentieth Century <http://www.icomos-isc20c.org/heritage-toolkit/> **Project Leader Smriti Pant with Enrique Madia**
6. **World Heritage Advice and training:** ISC20C provides advice within ICOMOS and externally about World Heritage nominations and management through policy development, nomination reviews and state of conservation reporting. **Project Leader: Gunny Harboe with Susan Macdonald and Sheridan Burke**
7. **Socialist Heritage Initiative** advocates for the recognition and protection of works of architecture and art from socialist times as cultural landmarks and historical monuments, collecting and providing information on locations and sites, current conditions of conservation, about the planning and building history of the socialist legacy. <http://socheritage.com/>  
**Project Leader: Jorg Haspel ISC20C Contact Kyle Normandin**
8. **Heritage Alerts** is an active program of international advocacy for C20 sites that raises international public consciousness about specific sites under threat <http://www.icomos-isc20c.org/heritage-alerts/> . **Project Leader: Olaf Steen with Gunny Harboe**
9. **mASEANa** is a 6-year-project with Docomomo Japan and mAAN, 2015-2020 supporting ASEAN nations conserving modern heritage. A mASEANa conference will be held in Bangkok in late October. **Yoshiyuki Yamana with Sheridan Burke**
10. **World Monuments Watch nominations:** ISC20 C members reviewed nominations for the 2015 and 2017 Watches; and will also do so for 2019. **Project Leader: Kyle Normandin**
11. **ISC20C website upgrade and social media activities** -a forum for discussion and exchange of information and conservation initiatives including via Facebook, Instagram by ISC20C. **Project Leader: Kyle Normandin with Laura Matarese and Dumitru Rusu**
12. **Membership Development** Growing our membership, especially emerging practitioners. Annual invitations, membership data base. **Project Leader: Riitta Salastie with Sheridan Burke**
13. **MAP Report review** Examines protection and listing practices for modern heritage Review proposed to resurvey, analyse and publish. **Project leader Sheridan Burke** Offer to volunteer Stefania Landi

***ACTION: Confirmed Triennial Work Plan, volunteers welcome to contact all project leaders***

## **12. Members Petch Kucha session (LS)**

Concetta Lenza (welcome to new designated voting member): Research Project on Mental Hospitals, Italy- seeks ISC20C member input

Susan Macdonald: GCI Keeping it Modern program

Maori rock carvings, Lake Taupo NZ

Britt Wisth: View from retirement.

Toyokawa Saikura: Yoyogi stadium CMP, Tokyo

Stefania Landi: ISCCL seminar, 2018

Paola Scaramuzza : Repairs historic concrete Scarpa's Brion cemetery

Jack Pyburn USA Civil rights sites

Sheridan Burke: Thematic Framework for Twentieth Century Heritage

***ACTION Lets make member Pecha Kuchas a feature of all ISC20C annual meetings!***

**Attachment** Innova Concrete budget